



Replicate Replicate - How You Can Take Part

*Intro session: Why replication? How is it done?
Where to find replication material?*

Philosophy of Economics Working Group

September 8, 2022

Gustavo A. Castillo Alvarez (Universidad de los Andes)

Jan H. Höffler (ReplicationWiki)

Diana Soeiro (ISCTE-Lisbon University Institute)



Outline



- 1 Working Group Philosophy of Economics
- 2 Personal Motivations
- 3 Why replication?
- 4 How to replicate?
- 5 Where to find replication material?
- 6 Technical instructions for the webinar series
- 7 Literature

Outline



- 1 Working Group Philosophy of Economics
- 2 Personal Motivations
- 3 Why replication?
- 4 How to replicate?
- 5 Where to find replication material?
- 6 Technical instructions for the webinar series
- 7 Literature



Working Group Philosophy of Economics



- The Institute for New Economic Thinking (INET): started after global financial crisis



Working Group Philosophy of Economics

- The Institute for New Economic Thinking (INET): started after global financial crisis
- Young Scholars Initiative (YSI)



Working Group Philosophy of Economics

- The Institute for New Economic Thinking (INET): started after global financial crisis
- Young Scholars Initiative (YSI)
- Working groups with regional or thematic focus



Working Group Philosophy of Economics

- The Institute for New Economic Thinking (INET): started after global financial crisis
- Young Scholars Initiative (YSI)
- Working groups with regional or thematic focus
- Philosophy of Economics group has (co-)organized for example groups for Discussion & Presentation, Writing, Peer Review, on Feminist Epistemology, workshops, and participated in events like the [Turin Festival of Economics](#)

Outline



- 1 Working Group Philosophy of Economics
- 2 Personal Motivations**
- 3 Why replication?
- 4 How to replicate?
- 5 Where to find replication material?
- 6 Technical instructions for the webinar series
- 7 Literature



Personal Motivation: Gustavo

- Best methods for empirical work?
- The need to use real data in undergrad courses
- My first laboratory experiment and my first webinar on replication
- Statistical significance, "*stargazing*"
- A professor's presentation on a failure to replicate a study on dishonesty (Dan Ariely's, et al. 2012 PNAS study)



Personal Motivation: Jan

- first PhD supervisor pointed me to topic
- gave first seminars
- former professor of mine had been editor for pivotal article
- first research I was working on did not seem replicable to me
- read about Institute for New Economic Thinking's grants
- suggested wiki collecting replications as grassroots activity

Outline



- 1 Working Group Philosophy of Economics
- 2 Personal Motivations
- 3 Why replication?**
- 4 How to replicate?
- 5 Where to find replication material?
- 6 Technical instructions for the webinar series
- 7 Literature



Why replication?

- learning about new methods, data sources



Why replication?

- learning about new methods, data sources
- critical thinking



Why replication?

- learning about new methods, data sources
- critical thinking
- make an own contribution: build on published findings, question them, detect errors, test robustness and generalizability



Why replication?

- learning about new methods, data sources
- critical thinking
- make an own contribution: build on published findings, question them, detect errors, test robustness and generalizability



Carmen M. Reinhart

☰ The New York Times

A Study That Set the Tone for Austerity Is Challenged

BY ANNIE LOWREY APRIL 16, 2013 2:36 PM

Source



Thomas Herndon




Why replication?

- learning about new methods, data sources
- critical thinking
- make an own contribution: build on published findings, question them, detect errors, test robustness and generalizability
- incentivize discussion, introduce more diverse perspectives to economics (dominated by researchers based in the US working with US data)



Why replication?

- learning about new methods, data sources
- critical thinking
- make an own contribution: build on published findings, question them, detect errors, test robustness and generalizability
- incentivize discussion, introduce more diverse perspectives to economics (dominated by researchers based in the US working with US data)
-  When using different methodology or different data, no surprise that outcomes can be different, doesn't invalidate original research

Outline



- 1 Working Group Philosophy of Economics
- 2 Personal Motivations
- 3 Why replication?
- 4 How to replicate?**
- 5 Where to find replication material?
- 6 Technical instructions for the webinar series
- 7 Literature



How to replicate?

Narrow sense

rerun original studies' data & code: check results and learn how they are produced

should always be the first step if possible

sounds easy, often isn't, even with available data & code

plus: data can be proprietary or sensitive



How to replicate?

Narrow sense

rerun original studies' data & code: check results and learn how they are produced

should always be the first step if possible

sounds easy, often isn't, even with available data & code

plus: data can be proprietary or sensitive

Wider sense

updating or using entirely new data or methods to check for robustness and/or generalizability

replication can help to overcome the incentive to preferably publish "significant" results

Do results still hold in different contexts like time periods or countries?



How to replicate?

Prepare a preanalysis plan:

What are your hypotheses and how do you want to test them?



Replication examples

Johnson et al *Journal of Monetary Economics* 2013 showed different versions of the Penn World Table lead to significantly different results in a number of studies

Chang & Li *Critical Finance Review* 2022 replicated several dozen studies on US growth from top journals and describe the challenges they encountered

resistance from authors of original studies & editors

- editors of the *Journal of Political Economy* repeatedly blocked the publication of replications even when studies contained clear errors (Häring 2008)
- Acemoglu et al 2012 entitled the working paper for a response to a replication of their work in the *American Economic Review*: “Hither thou shalt come but no further”
- An editor of the *Economic Journal* even replied to a correction of a study that had been positively reviewed that they don't publish replications

Outline



- 1 Working Group Philosophy of Economics
- 2 Personal Motivations
- 3 Why replication?
- 4 How to replicate?
- 5 Where to find replication material?**
- 6 Technical instructions for the webinar series
- 7 Literature



Where to find replication material?

data & code availability

often an issue, difficult to detect reasons of deviations from original results if original ones cannot be obtained
=> but that can be an opportunity!



Where to find replication material?

data & code availability

often an issue, difficult to detect reasons of deviations from original results if original ones cannot be obtained
=> but that can be an opportunity!

- ReplicationWiki



Where to find replication material?

data & code availability

often an issue, difficult to detect reasons of deviations from original results if original ones cannot be obtained
=> but that can be an opportunity!

- ReplicationWiki
- Find Economic Articles with Data



Where to find replication material?

data & code availability

often an issue, difficult to detect reasons of deviations from original results if original ones cannot be obtained
=> but that can be an opportunity!

- ReplicationWiki
- Find Economic Articles with Data
- journal archives



Where to find replication material?

data & code availability

often an issue, difficult to detect reasons of deviations from original results if original ones cannot be obtained
=> but that can be an opportunity!

- ReplicationWiki
- Find Economic Articles with Data
- journal archives
- author websites



Where to find replication material?

data & code availability

often an issue, difficult to detect reasons of deviations from original results if original ones cannot be obtained
=> but that can be an opportunity!

- ReplicationWiki
- Find Economic Articles with Data
- journal archives
- author websites

Most important:

Search for a topic that you are really interested in!

Outline



- 1 Working Group Philosophy of Economics
- 2 Personal Motivations
- 3 Why replication?
- 4 How to replicate?
- 5 Where to find replication material?
- 6 Technical instructions for the webinar series**
- 7 Literature



Instructions for the webinar series

- **Check** the schedule on the [webinar series page](#) and choose which presentations you'd like to participate in.
- **Create** accounts on the [ReplicationWiki](#) and on the [YSI platform](#) (both links direct to the pages to create your accounts).
- **Start** a sub-page under the webinar site with your session's information (instructions [here](#)):
 - Link to your replication materials (if you wish to share publicly) *or* just summarize on the page what you have done to prepare your session.
- **Watch** the pre-recorded video lecture before the live sessions.
- **Present** your replication in the live sessions and/or on the sub-page.
- **Participate** in live Q & A sessions of your peers (if available) and **contribute** to discussion pages of your peers at the time of your convenience!



In brief...

Actively engage during the webinar!



Created by ProSymbols

Participation by ProSymbols from Noun Project

Literature



- Acemoglu, Daron, Simon Johnson and James A. Robinson (2012), “The Colonial Origins of Comparative Development: An Empirical Investigation: Reply”, *American Economic Review*, 102(6), 3077-3110. DOI: [10.1257/aer.102.6.3077](https://doi.org/10.1257/aer.102.6.3077)
- Chang, Andrew C., Phillip Li (2022), “Is Economics Research Replicable? Sixty Published Papers From Thirteen Journals Say “Often Not.””, *Critical Finance Review* 11(1), 185-206. DOI: [10.1561/104.00000053](https://doi.org/10.1561/104.00000053)
- Häring, Nobert (2008), “No comment, please - Steven Levitt blocks an undesired statement”, *Handelsblatt*, June 23
- Hamermesh, Daniel S. (2007), “Viewpoint: Replication in economics”, *Canadian Journal of Economics*, 40(3), 715-33. DOI: [10.1111/j.1365-2966.2007.00428.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2966.2007.00428.x)
- Johnson, Simon, William Larson, Chris Papageorgiou, Arvind Subramanian (2013), “Is newer better? Penn World Table Revisions and their impact on growth estimates”, *Journal of Monetary Economics*, 60(2), 255–74. DOI: [10.1016/j.jmoneco.2012.10.022](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jmoneco.2012.10.022)
- **RETRACTED:** Shu, Lisa L., Nina Mazar, Francesca Gino, Dan Ariely, Max H. Bazerman (2012), “Signing at the beginning makes ethics salient and decreases dishonest self-reports in comparison to signing at the end”, *PNAS*, 109 (38) 15197-15200. DOI: [10.1073/pnas.1209746109](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1209746109)

Thank you for your attention!



**REPLICATING EMPIRICAL
STUDIES IN ECONOMICS**
an opportunity for students